Advancing Financial Inclusion: Innovative Financial Products and Services for Low-Income Households

October 12, 2017

Organized by the Federal Reserve Bank of Minneapolis

The Connecting Communities® audio conference series is a Federal Reserve System initiative intended to provide timely information on emerging and important community and economic development topics with a national audience. The audio conference series complements existing Federal Reserve Community Development outreach initiatives that are conducted through our regional Reserve Bank offices and at the Federal Reserve Board of Governors in Washington, D.C.
Thank you for attending today’s session. How to join (remember, this session is being recorded):

- Call-in number: 888-625-5230
- Conference code: 413 547 69#
- Webinar link: https://www.webcaster4.com/Webcast/Page/584/22624

You have two options to ask questions today:
These questions may be part of the recorded archive for this session.

- Email us at: communities@stls.frb.org
- Type your question into the chat box of the webinar

An archived recording of this session will be available on the Connecting Communities® website shortly after the session ends. Please visit www.stlouisfed.org/connectingcommunities/

In connection with this session, you can find a variety of additional resources on this topic, available at www.fedcommunities.org. We encourage you to browse through this site and to contact your regional office if you would like additional information on any of these items.
Legal Notices and Disclaimer

The information, analyses, and conclusions set forth are those of the presenters and do not necessarily indicate concurrence by the Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System, the Federal Reserve Banks, or members of their staffs.
• The Community Development function within the Federal Reserve System—consisting of individual departments at each of the 12 Federal Reserve Banks and at the Board of Governors—promotes economic growth and financial stability for low- and moderate-income (LMI) communities and individuals through a range of activities, including:
  
  – **Convening stakeholders**, including practitioners, financial institutions, nonprofits, governmental agencies, and the philanthropic and private sectors
  
  – **Conducting and sharing research** to examine economic challenges facing LMI communities and attendant policy implications
  
  – **Identifying emerging issues**
Today’s Presenters and Agenda

• **Anne Leland Clark**, Financial Capability and Learning Director, Prepare + Prosper, St. Paul, Minnesota

• **Joanna Smith-Ramani**, Associate Director, Financial Security Program and Director, Expanding Prosperity Impact Collaborative (EPIC), The Aspen Institute, Washington, D.C.

• **Lauren Leimbach**, Executive Director, Community Financial Resources, Berkeley, California

• The following will be discussed:
  – Research, current initiatives, and best practices to help address the challenges low-income households face in the financial marketplace
The Financial Inclusion Gap Is Real

Anne Leland Clark
Financial Capability and Learning Director
Prepare + Prosper
St. Paul, Minnesota
anne@prepareandprosper.org
The Reality in Numbers

Nearly 67 million adults in the United States are unbanked or underbanked.*

$141 billion annually is spent on fees and interest in the alternative financial services or “non-bank” marketplace.**

*2015 Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation National Survey of the Unbanked and Underbanked Households
**Center for Financial Services Innovation 2016 Financially Underserved Market Size Study
Understanding U.S. Financial Lives

Joanna Smith-Ramani
Associate Director/Financial Security Program Director, EPIC
The Aspen Institute
Washington, D.C.
joanna.smithramani@aspeninstitute.org
Future of Work

• 40.4 percent of the U.S. workforce is now made up of contingent workers—with biggest growth in part-time jobs:
  – Higher poverty rates
  – Lower pay
  – Greater job instability
  – Less access to workplace benefits
  – Increased reliance on public benefits
Income volatility is common among US Financial Diaries households
But the causes of volatility vary, including job changes, seasonal work, and secondary income sources.

Mateo & Lucia earned $55,200
from June 2012 to May 2013, bouncy by Mateo's stable job.
Monthly income ranged from $3130 to $4720

Sandra Young earned $34,600
from Oct 2012 to Sep 2013, half in just a three months.
Monthly income ranged from $880 to $10,190

Molly & Dustin earned $27,100
from June 2012 to May 2013, helped by social security and food stamps.
Monthly income ranged from $1100 to $4500

Elena Navarro earned $32,700
from June 2012 to May 2013, but she changed jobs twice, with negative income effects.
Monthly income ranged from $650 to $3900

Amy Cox earned $28,700
from June 2012 to May 2013, with spikes from an EITC and od grants.
Monthly income ranged from $900 to $12,000

To learn more, visit www.usfinancialdiaries.org
Prevalence of Income Volatility

- 21 percent of individuals experienced some unusually high- or low-income months, and an additional 10 percent reported their income often varies “quite a bit” from one month to the next (2013 Survey of Household Economics and Decisionmaking).
- Low-wage households experienced on average 5 out of 12 months with a change in income of over 25 percent (roughly split between rises and falls) (The U.S. Financial Diaries).
- 4 in 10 individuals saw more than a 30 percent month-to-month fluctuation in income between 2012 and 2014 (JP Morgan Chase Institute).
- 60 percent of American households reported experiencing a financial shock in the last 12 months (Survey of American Family Finances 2015, Pew).
Drivers of Income Volatility—Largely Labor Issues

• Of those who self-reported volatile monthly incomes in a recent survey, 40 percent blamed an irregular work schedule for the swings.

• An analysis of banking records found that, for nearly one in four jobs, paycheck amounts varied by more than 30 percent from paycheck to paycheck. This within-job variation in pay explains 86 percent of the month-to-month variation in labor income.

• Between 1971 and 2008, annual variability in hours worked has risen hand-in-hand with—and helps explain—the rise in income volatility.

• Week-to-week variation in hours and working a variable or rotating schedule are significantly related to higher income volatility.

• Three-quarters of EPIC’s panel of experts identified irregular hours as one of the three most significant causes of income volatility—by far the most popular choice.
Impact on Households

• Delayed and disrupted **household consumption:**
  – Paying bills late
  – Foregoing necessary medical care
• Volatility increases the risk of experiencing **food insecurity.**
• Month-to-month volatility can endanger a household’s ability to **access safety net programs.**
• Fluctuation can lead to **utility disruptions** and **housing instability.**
• Use of **costly financial services** and late fees
Solutions Framework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STRATEGIES</th>
<th>GOALS</th>
<th>POTENTIAL FOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EMPLOYERS</td>
<td>FINANCIAL PROVIDERS</td>
<td>GOVERNMENT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Prevention

**Stable employment**
Regular hours, predictable earnings, and generous benefits

**Safety net**
Easily accessible social programs that are designed for volatile incomes

**Liquidity**
High-quality cash management tools for smoothing income and consumption
## Recommended Solutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategies</th>
<th>Goals</th>
<th>Most Promising Interventions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stable employment</td>
<td>Regular hours, predictable earnings, and generous benefits</td>
<td>Predictable scheduling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety net</td>
<td>Easily accessible social programs that are designed for volatile incomes</td>
<td>Unemployment insurance reform, Wage insurance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liquidity</td>
<td>High-quality cash management tools, including savings, credit, and insurance, for smoothing income and consumption</td>
<td>Payroll innovation, Shortfall savings tools, Hybrid financial products</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Facilitating Financial Inclusion

Lauren Leimbach
Executive Director
Community Financial Resources
Berkeley, California
Lauren@communityfinancialresources.net
As a nonprofit organization, we:

- Research, develop, and promote low-cost, high-functionality financial products and services for LMI households
- Build the capacity of community-based organizations to enhance the financial capabilities of their constituents
- Establish best practice standards for consumer-friendly financial services
- Promote a fair and inclusive economy
Overcoming Banking Obstacles

- Cost
- Variable cash flow/penalty fees
- Language
- Cultural experience
- Garnishments/service issues
- Location and hours
- ID requirements
- Product complexity
- Trust
- Marketing “noise”
Engagement Strategies: Aligning Priorities, Motivation, and Behaviors

- Design products and tools to address the financial lives of low-income households
- Bring products and tools to the people
- Acknowledge previous negative experiences
- Facilitate immediate product enrollment
- Provide targeted consumer education
- Encourage task-based follow-up
Using Products and Tools to Build Financial Capability

• Products:
  – Prepaid debit card
  – Secured credit card
  – Shared secure loans
  – Credit-builder certificate of deposit (CD)

• Tools:
  – Direct deposit
  – Spending trackers
  – Automatic savings
  – Behavior trackers
  – Matched savings
How the Focus Card Works

- Functions like a bank Visa ATM/check card without the penalty fees

- Load cash

Add value

- Direct deposit:
  - Payroll
  - Tax refund
  - Benefits

Use

- Share funds:
  - Joint account
  - Card-to-card

- Purchasing
- Bill payment
- Cash
- Savings account
Automatic Savings Bonus Program: Set it and Forget it!

Cardholder opens savings account with at least $10.

Cardholder sets up automatic triggers to move at least $20 a month.

Cardholder saves at least $20 a month for three months in a row; will have $70 in account.

Upon verification, Community Financial Resources will deposit an additional $50.
Credit Tools

• Credit Karma: On-line credit review
• Free credit report: www.annualcreditreport.com
• Connection to a good secured credit card—a card-based revolving line of credit based on security deposit in savings account
• Good for those with no credit or those rebuilding credit
• Stepping stone to unsecured credit
• Incentivizes savings
Other Credit-Building Options

- Credit union savings accounts provide access to shared secured loans.
- Credit-building CD:
  - Borrow $500–$1000 and lockdown in CD
  - Make money payments like installment loan
  - Build savings and credit
Enhanced Financial Education

• What: Task-based learning
• Why: Information and intention does not necessarily translate to action.
• When: As people are learning how to use a new product or tool
• People learn best by doing or trying to solve an immediate problem they face.
  – Set up tasks for participants to apply financial management concepts
  – Coaching model
Community Financial Resources’ Approach

• Product design and vendor management
• Communications, marketing, and outreach materials
• Client engagement training
• Product enrollment and first-line customer service support
• Effective product usage training materials
• Enhanced behavior-based financial education
If You Need Help . . .

Lauren Leimbach, Executive Director
Lauren@communityfinancialresources.net
510-559-8638
FAIR: An Integrated Product Solution

Anne Leland Clark
Financial Capability and Learning Director
Prepare + Prosper
St. Paul, Minnesota
anne@prepareandprosper.org
FAIR: Financial Solution

- **FAIR credit builder**: No money down! Consumer makes monthly, on-time payments to build credit and savings.

- **FAIR savings account**: Interest-earning savings account with no minimum balance requirement.

- **FAIR checking account**: A “checkless” checking (demand deposit account or DDA) account with VISA debit card with no overdraft and no minimum balance.
Distribution:
Getting products into people’s hands
Adoption:
Making products that work for people
Adherence: Making it “sticky” enough to ensure meaningful impact
FAIR: Where We’ve Been

Photo from FAIR enrollment event at P+P in December 2016.
Having the opportunity to be introduced to FAIR at Prepare + Prosper was a game-changer for me. I opened a checking and a savings account for the first time in five years and have begun to build my credit. I’m now banked.

FAIR will continue to be my banking choice. Since FAIR was the only banking opportunity that gave me another chance . . . I’m proud and empowered and grateful there’s products out there that gave me another opportunity to have an account again.

—Eumeka
FAIR: What's Next

**Test—2017 Completed!**
- Prepare + Prosper sole distributor reached 53 consumers with 104 financial products.

**Pilot—2018**
- 5 distribution partners reach 300 consumers in Twin Cities.

**Launch—2019**
- 20 distribution partners across Minnesota reach 1,500+ consumers.

**National Scale—2020**
- 30+ distribution partners reach 5,000+ consumers.

**MINNESOTA**

- Connecting Communities®
- Sponsored by the Federal Reserve System
More on FAIR

www.prepareandprosper.org/fair
Join Us for Our Next Connecting Communities!

• Solutions for Mitigating Neighborhood Blight: A Discussion of Innovative Programs and Policy Strategies
  – Thursday, November 2, 2017
  – 2–3 p.m. CT/3–4 p.m. ET
  – Presenters:
    • Steve Lockwood, Executive Director, Frayser CDC
    • Krysta Pate, Program Director, Detroit Home Mortgage
    • Kim Graziani, Vice President/Director of National Technical Assistance, Center for Community Progress
    • Matt Josephs, Senior Vice President, LISC
Questions?

You have two options to ask questions today:

1. Email us at: communities@stls.frb.org
2. Click the “Ask Question” button in the webinar
Thank you to today’s presenters and to all participants for joining this session.

Next steps:

- All session materials are available on our website, and in the next few days, we will post an audio file of today’s session.
- If you have topical suggestions for future sessions or any questions about this program, please feel free to contact us at communities@stls.frb.org.
- Information about future sessions will be posted on our website, along with archived materials from past sessions: https://bsr.stlouisfed.org/connectingCommunities
In connection with this session, you can find a variety of additional resources on this topic, available at www.fedcommunities.org.

It provides an array of practical resources to help you in your role as a community development professional, whether your work involves supporting people, places, the policy and practice of community development, or small business development.